Track 6
Changing environment and risks: planning for resilience
Community responses to displacement threats in flood-prone areas.
The case of the Ciliwung River, Jakarta

Anastasia Widyaningsih & Pieter Van den Broeck
KU Leuven, Belgium
AIMS OF RESEARCH

- To get a **better understanding** about the dynamics of resettlement processes of riverbank communities in Jakarta in regards to flood mitigation effort.

- To understand how did the riverbank community movements **contested the pattern of urban development** in Jakarta.

- **Qualitative research** = 2 primary case studies, Bukit Duri and Kampung Tongkol.
ACTOR MAPPING

Community responses to displacements in Jakarta, WIDYANINGSIH & VAN DEN BROECK, KU Leuven
anastasia.wiwid@yahoo.com | ISOCARP World Planning Congress Jakarta-Bogor 2019
Community responses to displacements in Jakarta, WIDYANINGSIH & VAN DEN BROECK, KU Leuven
anastasia.wiid@yahoo.com | ISOCARP World Planning Congress Jakarta-Bogor 2019
The VOC first built a fort and ware-houses along the Ciliwung River to support their mercantile business. The VOC rebuilt Batavia according to the Dutch's canal system. Batavia became its port city. The Old Batavia was abandoned. New roads, tramways were installed, connecting the new city center with the new harbor on the northeastern coast. In search of identity after Independence, Monumental urban projects were launched to transform and exhibit Jakarta as the nation's exemplary center. The emerging new towns and industrial areas all around Jakarta Metropolitan Region following the establishment of highway networks and deregulation of investment and automotive industry policies.
THE HISTORY OF JAKARTA’S KAMPUNGS

- 19th - 1945: Dutch Colonization
- 1945: Independence / Old Order
- 1967: New Order
- 1997: Reform Era
- 2001: Megawati S. Sukarnoputri
- 2004: Susilo B. Yudhoyono
- 2014: Joko Widodo

1942-45: Japanese occupation

Legal dualism of land

Housing Policy
- Dutch Ethical Policy "Kampung Improvement"
- National + WB Kampung Improvement Program (KIP)
  - Phase 1
  - Phase 2
  - Phase 3

Flood Management
- National PERUMNAS
  - The Modest and the Very Modest Unit
- National Million Houses Program
  - 1,000 Towers
  - FLPP
  - Rusunawa

Community responses to displacements in Jakarta, WIDYANINGSIH & VAN DEN BROECK, KU Leuven
anastasia.wiwid@yahoo.com | ISOCARP World Planning Congress Jakarta-Bogor 2019
JAKARTA’S LARGE URBAN PROJECTS

Islet | Size (Ha) | Developer
--- | --- | ---
A | 79 | PT. Kapuk Naga Indah
B | 380 | PT. Kapuk Naga Indah
C | 276 | PT. Mandala Kriya Yudha and PT. Pembangunan Jaya Ancol
D | 312 | PT. Jakarta Propertindo
E | 284 | PT. Taman Harapan Indah
F | 190 | PT. Jakarta Propertindo
G | 161 | PT. Muara Wisesa Samudera
H | 63 | PT. Taman Harapan Indah
I | 405 | PT. Jaladri and PT. Pembangunan Jaya Ancol
J | 316 | PT. Pembangunan Jaya Ancol
K | 32 | PT. Pembangunan Jaya Ancol
L | 447 | PT. Mandala Kriya Yudha and PT. Pembangunan Jaya Ancol
M | 587 | PT. Mandala Kriya Yudha and PT. Pelindo
N | 344 | Pemprov. DKI Jakarta
O | 369 | Pemprov. DKI Jakarta
P | 463 | Pemprov. DKI Jakarta
Q | 369 | Pemprov. DKI Jakarta

Community responses to displacements in Jakarta, WIDYANINGSIH & VAN DEN BROECK, KU Leuven
anastasia.wiid@yahoo.com | ISOCARP World Planning Congress Jakarta-Bogor 2019
Community responses to displacements in Jakarta, WIDYANINGSIH & VAN DEN BROECK, KU Leuven
anastasia.wiid@yahoo.com | ISOCARP World Planning Congress Jakarta-Bogor 2019

**CASE STUDY SELECTION**

**Case 1 Bukit Duri**
*(one area with Kampung Pulo)*
**Location:** Bukit Duri subdistrict, South Jakarta

**Case 2 Kampung Tongkol**
*(one area with Pasar Ikan, Kp Lodan and Krapu)*
**Location:** Ciliwung tributary, Ancol subdistrict, North Jakarta
Partly evicted on May 2016.

**Case 2 Rusunawa Marunda**
**Location:** Cilincing subdistrict, North Jakarta
A home to relocatees from Kp Tongkol, Lodan, and Krapu.
BUKIT DURI: STORIES FROM THE MIDDLE STREAM

THE FORMER MEESTER CORNELIS

Bukit Duri and the neighbouring Kampung Pulo are densely populated areas with over 48,000 people within a square kilometre, dwelling in rather informal settlements. As flooding has been a regular event, living with it has become an attitude. Thus, the residents of both kampungs have generated particular coping strategies.
BUKIT DURI: STORIES FROM THE MIDDLE STREAM

16th century - 1945
Meester Cornelis

2000
CILIWUNG MERDEKA(CM)

Major floods

2009
CM started mapping

SOCIODEMIC WEB
OF KAMPUNG PEOPLE


Community responses to displacements in Jakarta, WIDYANINGSIH & VAN DEN BROECK, KU Leuven anastasia.wiwid@yahoo.com | ISOCARP World Planning Congress Jakarta-Bogor 2019
BUKIT DURI: STORIES FROM THE MIDDLE STREAM

16th century - 1945
Meester Cornelis

2000
CILIWUNG MERDEKA(CM)

Major floods

2009
CM started mapping

2012
- River normalization project
- “Kampung Susun” proposal

2015
- Rejection of “Kampung Susun”
- Kampung Pulo eviction

KAMPUNG SUSUN PROPOSAL

- Built on-site
- Ground floor area for socioeconomic activities
- Densified to cater the entire kampung residents, but no higher than 5 storey
- Flood-resilient building.

Community responses to displacements in Jakarta, WIDYANINGSIH & VAN DEN BROECK, KU Leuven
anastasia.wiid@yahoo.com | ISOCARP World Planning Congress Jakarta-Bogor 2019
BUKIT DURI: STORIES FROM THE MIDDLE STREAM

- 16th century - 1945
  Meester Cornelis
- 2000
  CILIWUNG MERDEKA(CM)
  Major floods
- 2009
  CM started mapping
- 2012
  - River normalization project
  - “Kampung Susun” proposal
- 2015
  - Rejection of “Kampung Susun”
  - Kampung Pulo eviction
- January 2016
  First eviction (85 households)
- April 2016
  People’s Market Festival
- September 2016
  Major eviction (410 families)
- January 2017
  Class action won
- July 2017
  Recent eviction (358 households)

THE DEMOLITION DAYS

Community responses to displacements in Jakarta, WIDYANINGSIH & VAN DEN BROECK, KU Leuven
anastasia.wiwid@yahoo.com | ISOCARP World Planning Congress Jakarta-Bogor 2019
KAMPUNG TONGKOL: STORIES FROM THE LOWER STREAM

- 16th century - 1945
  Old City of Batavia

- 1970
  Riverbank kampung flourished

- 1990-1992
  Harbor Rd flyover

- 1994
  PROKASIH (Cleaning river program)

- 2014
  First eviction notice

- May 2015
  Eviction of the neighboring kampungs: Kunir, Kencur, Balokan

---

13
May 2015
Eviction of the neighboring kampungs: Kunir, Kencur, Balokan

---

Community responses to displacements in Jakarta, WIDYANINGSIH & VAN DEN BROECK, KU Leuven
anastasia.wiwid@yahoo.com | ISOCARP World Planning Congress Jakarta-Bogor 2019

---
KAMPUNG TONGKOL: STORIES FROM THE LOWER STREAM

16th century - 1945
Old City of Batavia
1970
Riverbank kampung flourished
1990-1992
Harbor Rd flyover
1994
PROKASIH (Cleaning river program)
2014
First eviction notice
May 2015
Eviction of the neighboring kampungs: Kunir, Kencur, Balokan
October 2015
Planning of “Inspection Kampung”
December 2015
Prototype House
January 2016
Completion of the project
April 2016
Pasar Ikan eviction
April 2017
Political contract

Prototype House
+ Six families in one three-storey building
+ Involving community participation in planning, design, and construction processes
+ The floor area varies from 8.75 – 12.5 sqm.
+ Outdoor kitchen
+ Communal bathroom
+ Communal septic tank

Community responses to displacements in Jakarta, WIDYANINGSIH & VAN DEN BROECK, KU Leuven
anastasia.wiwid@yahoo.com | ISOCARP World Planning Congress Jakarta-Bogor 2019
The far location of Rusunawa Marunda is one of the main constraints faced by the relocatees.

There are a few playgrounds and public parks, but most of them are vulnerable and indefensible due to lack of monitoring.

Economic activities in Rusunawa Marunda is emerging, even though still limited to the designated area. In this particular rusunawa, opening warung in room units is allowed.

There are some initiatives to support the residents’ livelihood, such as green houses funded by the government, urban gardening, fish cultivation; and batik-making.
ADAPTED THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

LEGACY OF COLONIALISM
Yeoh 2001, Dick and Rimmel 1998

COMMUNITY RESPONSES TO DISPLACEMENTS IN JAKARTA

WIDYANINGSIH & VAN DEN BROECK, KU Leuven

ANASTASIA.WIWID@YAHOO.COM

ISOCARP WORLD PLANNING CONGRESS JAKARTA-BOGOR 2019

ADAPTED THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

MACRO-SCALE ANALYSIS

WORLD POLITICAL ECONOMY
Sager 2012

GLOBAL CITY (MODERNITY)

REAL ESTATE MECHANISM

URBAN DEVELOPMENT PROJECTS

THE GREAT GARUDA (NCICD)

URBAN PROBLEMS

Flooding & Land Subsidence

Housing Backlog

Land Tenure System

POLICIES

INVESTMENT POLICY

RECLAMATION LAND USE POLICY

FLOOD MITIGATION WATER MANAGEMENT

HOUSING POLICY PROCUREMENT SYSTEM RESETTLEMENT POLICY

DISPLACEMENTS

RESISTANCE

SOCIAL INNOVATION

LIMITED CONSULTATION, MANIPULATION, AND INTIMIDATION

DISCOURSES

“Displacement” “Development” “Risk”

NEW DISCOURSES
“Urban conservation” “Urban Political Ecology” (Cook & Swyngedouw 2012)

URBAN PROBLEMS

Perpetual marginalization and exclusion of kampung residents

Data manipulation

Polish contracts

Limited consultation, manipulation, and intimidation

Political contracts

Other UDPs (MRT, LRT, Asian Games)

SAGER 2012

LEGACY OF COLONIALISM

Yeoh 2001, Dick and Rimmel 1998

SAGER 2012

HOUSING BACKLOG

HOUSING POLICY PROCUREMENT SYSTEM RESETTLEMENT POLICY

DISPLACEMENTS

DATA MANIPULATION

NEW DISCOURSES
“Urban conservation” “Urban Political Ecology” (Cook & Swyngedouw 2012)

“Displacement” “Development” “Risk”

NEW DISCOURSES
“Urban conservation” “Urban Political Ecology” (Cook & Swyngedouw 2012)

MACRO-SCALE ANALYSIS

WORLD POLITICAL ECONOMY
Sager 2012

GLOBAL CITY (MODERNITY)

REAL ESTATE MECHANISM

URBAN DEVELOPMENT PROJECTS

THE GREAT GARUDA (NCICD)

URBAN PROBLEMS

Flooding & Land Subsidence

Housing Backlog

Land Tenure System

POLICIES

INVESTMENT POLICY

RECLAMATION LAND USE POLICY

FLOOD MITIGATION WATER MANAGEMENT

HOUSING POLICY PROCUREMENT SYSTEM RESETTLEMENT POLICY

DISPLACEMENTS

RESISTANCE

SOCIAL INNOVATION

LIMITED CONSULTATION, MANIPULATION, AND INTIMIDATION

DISCOURSES

“Displacement” “Development” “Risk”

NEW DISCOURSES
“Urban conservation” “Urban Political Ecology” (Cook & Swyngedouw 2012)

URBAN PROBLEMS

Perpetual marginalization and exclusion of kampung residents

Data manipulation

Political contracts

Limited consultation, manipulation, and intimidation

Other UDPs (MRT, LRT, Asian Games)

SAGER 2012

LEGACY OF COLONIALISM

Yeoh 2001, Dick and Rimmel 1998

SAGER 2012

HOUSING BACKLOG

HOUSING POLICY PROCUREMENT SYSTEM RESETTLEMENT POLICY

DISPLACEMENTS

DATA MANIPULATION

NEW DISCOURSES
“Urban conservation” “Urban Political Ecology” (Cook & Swyngedouw 2012)

“Displacement” “Development” “Risk”

NEW DISCOURSES
“Urban conservation” “Urban Political Ecology” (Cook & Swyngedouw 2012)

MACRO-SCALE ANALYSIS

WORLD POLITICAL ECONOMY
Sager 2012

GLOBAL CITY (MODERNITY)

REAL ESTATE MECHANISM

URBAN DEVELOPMENT PROJECTS

THE GREAT GARUDA (NCICD)

URBAN PROBLEMS

Flooding & Land Subsidence

Housing Backlog

Land Tenure System

POLICIES

INVESTMENT POLICY

RECLAMATION LAND USE POLICY

FLOOD MITIGATION WATER MANAGEMENT

HOUSING POLICY PROCUREMENT SYSTEM RESETTLEMENT POLICY

DISPLACEMENTS

RESISTANCE

SOCIAL INNOVATION

LIMITED CONSULTATION, MANIPULATION, AND INTIMIDATION

DISCOURSES

“Displacement” “Development” “Risk”

NEW DISCOURSES
“Urban conservation” “Urban Political Ecology” (Cook & Swyngedouw 2012)

URBAN PROBLEMS

Perpetual marginalization and exclusion of kampung residents

Data manipulation

Political contracts

Limited consultation, manipulation, and intimidation

Other UDPs (MRT, LRT, Asian Games)

SAGER 2012

LEGACY OF COLONIALISM

Yeoh 2001, Dick and Rimmel 1998

SAGER 2012

HOUSING BACKLOG

HOUSING POLICY PROCUREMENT SYSTEM RESETTLEMENT POLICY

DISPLACEMENTS

DATA MANIPULATION

NEW DISCOURSES
“Urban conservation” “Urban Political Ecology” (Cook & Swyngedouw 2012)

“Displacement” “Development” “Risk”

NEW DISCOURSES
“Urban conservation” “Urban Political Ecology” (Cook & Swyngedouw 2012)
CONCLUSIONS

• Forces commodifying the city’s urban environments and flood protection technology discursively mobilized the environmental crisis, and created injustice. Thus, tapping into urban political ecology and environmental justice theories seem appropriate to get a better understanding of such urban transformation processes and how they affect the social cohesion of the city.

• Force-eviction signalizes ‘an abuse of power’ as it discriminates and victimizes the most marginalized groups in society. It also creates more social and economic problems rather than solving ones.

• The affected riverbank communities responded differently depending on some key determinants. For those who resist, their movements were path-dependent and place-specific. However, the riverbank communities learned from each other’s mistakes.

• The social innovation perspective helps to uncover the possibility of a more fundamental alternative local development combining spatial reorganization, local economic transformation, alternative discourse-building, technical architectural solutions, health and sanitation aspects, and renewed socio-environmental thinking.

• Governance aspects also appear to be crucial, which is apparent from changed relationships between the local community and ‘traditional’ politics, a radical participative perspective, the use of legal procedures, and changing roles of the local community, NGOs, individual families, and community leaders.